

DRAFT

**COMMITTEE ON EQUAL OPPORTUNITIES IN
SCIENCE AND ENGINEERING
MEETING MINUTES
October 25-26, 2010**

Meeting Site

National Science Foundation (NSF), Room 1235; Wilson Boulevard; Arlington, Virginia 22230

Meeting Participants

Members Present:

Dr. Cecilia Conrad, Pomona College, Claremont, CA
Dr. Evelyn Hammonds, Harvard University, Cambridge, MA
Dr. Richard E. Ladner, University of Washington, Seattle, WA
Dr. Marigold Linton, University of Kansas, Lawrence, KS
Dr. George Middendorf, Howard University, Washington, DC
Dr. Maria (Mia) Ong, TERC, Cambridge, MA
Dr. Eugenia Paulus, North Hennepin Community College, Brooklyn Park, MN
Dr. Muriel Poston (CEOSE Chair), Skidmore College, Saratoga Springs, NY
Dr. Alex Ramirez, HACU National Headquarters, San Antonio, TX
Dr. Wendy Raymond, Williams College, Williamstown, MA

Members Absent:

Ms. Sandra Begay-Campbell, Sandia National Laboratories, Albuquerque, NM
Dr. Joseph S. Francisco, Purdue University, West Lafayette, IN
Ms. Lueny Morell, Hewlett-Packard Company, Aguadilla, PR

CEOSE Executive Liaison/CEOSE/Executive Secretary:

Dr. Margaret E. M. Tolbert, Senior Advisor, Office of Integrative Activities, NSF

OIA/NSF Primary Support Staff Members

Ms. Geraldine (Geri) Farvés, Program Specialist, Office of Integrative Activities/NSF
Ms. Crystal Blue, Program Assistant, Office of Integrative Activities/NSF

Non-Members Who Attended/Participated in Discussions/Made Presentations at the Meeting:

Dr. Richard Alo , NSF/EHR/DUE Dr. Boggs Andress , Dr. Robert Barnhill , SACNAS Ms. Lezli Baskerville , NAFEO Ms. Carrie Billy , AIHEC Dr. Juliana M. Blome , NIH/NIGMS Dr. Henry N. Blount , NSF/OD/OIA/EPSCoR Dr. Andress Boggs , University of Texas Dr. Kenneth Gerard Boutte , NSF/EHR/HRD Dr. Rosalina Bray , NIH/NIGMS Dr. Albert Bridgewater , MDB Dr. Joan Burrelli , NSF/SBE/SRS Ms. Judit Camacho , SACNAS Dr. Lynda T. Carlson , NSF/SBE/SRS Dr. Laura (Jodi) Chase , NSF/EHR/HRD Dr. Julia V. Clark , NSF/EHR/DRL Dr. Stephen Cohen , NSF/SBE/SRS Mr. Eric Gold , NSF/OD/OGC	Dr. Walter V. Collier , Beyond The Bottom Line, Inc. Dr. Kellina Craig-Henderson , NSF/SBE/SRS Ms. Carmen Cromartie , Captioner, Precise Reporting Ms. Adrian Dahood , NSF/OD/OPP Ms. Laura-Lee Davidson , QEM Network, Inc. Ms. Corinda Davis , Beyond The Bottom Line, Inc. Dr. Anthony DePass , Long Island University- Brooklyn Campus Dr. Lorelle Espinosa , IHEP Ms. Lisa Evans , NIH Dr. Jaquelina Falkenheim , NSF/SBE/SRS Dr. Joan Ferrini-Mundy , NSF/EHR Dr. Mary J. Frase , NSF/SBE/OAD Dr. Joan M. Frye , NSF/OD/OIA Dr. John Gawalt , NSF/SBE/SRS Ms. Simona Gilbert , NSF/OD/OIA Ms. Tracy Gorman , NSF/OD Dr. Lynn Milan , NSF/SBE/SRS
---	--

DRAFT

<p>Ms. Sherrie M. B. Green, NSF/OD/OIA Dr. Jong-on Hahm, NSF/OD/OISE Dr. W. Lance Haworth, NSF/OD/OIA Dr. Peter Henderson, National Research Council Dr. James A. Hicks, NSF/EHR/HRD Dr. Meldon Hollis, WHI-HBCU Dr. Aithi Hong, Association of American Universities Dr. J. Arthur Jones, QEM Network, Inc. Dr. Nimmi Kannankutty, NSF/SBE/SRS Dr. Fae L. Korsmo, NSF/OD Dr. Joslyn Kravitz, NIH/ORWH Dr. Susanne M. LaFratta, NSF/OD/OPP Dr. Mark H. Leddy, NSF/EHR/HRD Dr. James (Jim) Lightbourne, NSF/EHR/DGE Dr. Cora B. Marrett, Acting Director of NSF, NSF/OD Dr. J.V. Martinez, U.S. Department of Energy/Office of Science (Federal Liaison to CEOSE) Dr. Patty McAllister, Council of Graduate Schools Dr. Shirley McBay, QEM Network, Inc. Dr. Steve Meacham, NSF/OD/OIA</p>	<p>Dr. Jeri Mulrow, NSF/SBE/SRS Dr. José Muñoz, NSF/CIO Dr. Carl Person, NASA (Federal Liaison to CEOSE) Ms. Carolyn Piper, NSF/ODI Mr. David Pittman, C&EN News Dr. Steve Proudfoot, NSF/SBE/SRS Dr. Earnestine Psalmonds, NSF/EHR/DGE & NRC Dr. Emilda Rivers, NSF/SBE/SRS Mr. Larry Rudolph, NSF/OGC Dr. Victor Santiago, NSF/EHR/HRD Ms. Beth Scott, American Association of University Women Dr. Elizabeth Strickland, NSB Office Ms. Marilyn Suiter, NSF/EHR/HRD Dr. Ester Sztejn, NAS Dr. Audrey Trotman, NOAA (Federal Liaison to CEOSE) Dr. Robert Webber, NSF/OISE Dr. Mark L. Weiss, NSF/SBE/BCS Dr. Matthew Wilson, NSB Office Dr. Gloria D. Yancey, NSF/SBE/BCS</p>
--	---

Meeting Notes

Monday, October 25, 2010

Opening Statement and Discussion

At 8:45 a.m., **Dr. Muriel Poston** opened the meeting, greeted everyone, and reviewed the agenda. She gave a brief overview of her October 20th meeting with **Dr. Cora B. Marrett**, who was then the Acting National Science Foundation (NSF) Director. She outlined the following topics that were covered in that meeting: access to data for the *2009-2010 CEOSE Biennial Report* to Congress (particularly the demographic data on advisory committees and staff members), the letter to **Dr. Marrett** to advise of the CEOSE concerns about the proposed Comprehensive Broadening Participation of Undergraduates in STEM (CBP-US) Program, the input that **Dr. Joan Ferrini-Mundy** received relative to the proposed CBP-US Program (a major concern expressed by some was the addition of only \$13 million to the proposed program while adding a broader array of institutions), the probability of establishing an NSF program focused on the science of broadening participation, and the pending response from the National Science Board (NSB) on having broadening participation separated from the Broader Impacts Criterion and included as an individual review criterion. Currently, the NSB has a Task Force that is studying the NSF review criteria. **Dr. Poston** also presented information on the topic of insufficient linkage across NSF with respect to broadening participation. Following the briefing by **Dr. Poston**, CEOSE members, liaisons, and special guests introduced themselves.

Approval of the Minutes

CEOSE members concurred with the approval that **Dr. Poston** gave on September 29, 2010, for the minutes of the meeting held on June 29-30, 2010. No changes in the minutes were identified.

Plans for the Mini-Symposium on the Science of Broadening Participation

Dr. Cecilia Conrad summarized plans for the mini-symposium on the science of broadening participation. No action items were developed for CEOSE members.

Reports by CEOSE Liaisons to NSF Advisory Committees

DRAFT

Oral reports were made by the following CEOSE Liaisons to NSF Advisory Committees:

Dr. Alex Ramirez - Advisory Committee on Cyberinfrastructure (ACCI)

Dr. Richard Ladner - Computer Information Science and Engineering Advisory Committee (CISE AC)

Dr. Eugenia Paulus - Engineering Directorate's Advisory Committee (ENG AC)

Dr. Maria (Mia) Ong - Social, Behavioral, and Economic Sciences Advisory Committee (SBE AC)

Dr. George Middendorf - International Science and Engineering Advisory Committee (OISE AC)

ACTION ITEM: *Dr. Middendorf promised to present information on the availability of technical assistance by OISE staff for Minority Serving Institutions during the February 2011 meeting of CEOSE.*

Each of the following CEOSE members reported that the advisory committee to which she was assigned did not hold a meeting between the June and October 2010 CEOSE meeting dates.

- **Dr. Wendy Raymond** - Advisory Committee for GPR Performance Assessment (ACGPA) – No meeting of the ACGPA was held between June and October 2010.
- **Dr. Marigold Linton** –Office of Polar Programs Advisory Committee (OPP AC) – The OPP AC meeting was canceled. OPP AC members will hold a telephone conference call in November 2010.
- **Dr. Muriel Poston** was unable to attend the Biological Sciences Advisory Committee (BIO AC) meeting, which was held in Boulder, Colorado.
- According to **Dr. Evelyn Hammonds**, the agenda for the Education and Human Resources Directorate Advisory Committee (EHR AC) meeting is being developed.
- **Dr. Cecilia A. Conrad** reported that the Budget and Operations Advisory Committee (B&O AC) meeting is scheduled for November 2010.

ACTION ITEM: *CEOSE Liaisons to NSF advisory committees are requested by the CEOSE Chair to volunteer to give overviews of CEOSE activities at their respective advisory committee meetings. The foci should be on the planned mini-symposium on the science of broadening participation and other CEOSE areas of concern (e.g., broadening participation in STEM; the NSB study of the merit review criteria, especially the Broader Impacts Criterion; and international involvement in NSF programs).*

ACTION ITEM: *Dr. Tolbert is to ensure that each Executive Secretary of an NSF advisory committee receives an appropriate number of copies of the "2007-2008 CEOSE Biennial Report" to Congress for distribution to members.*

CEOSE Ad Hoc Subcommittees

CEOSE members discussed the types of *ad hoc* subcommittees that are needed. **ACTION ITEM:** *CEOSE members are to review the suggested types of ad hoc subcommittees and other suggestions and decide on the exact ones to establish. ACTION ITEM: Drs. Poston and Ladner are to draft a description that contains details on what CEOSE members want the NSF directorates and major offices to provide in terms of changes in broadening participation in STEM over the past five years.*

Discussion of CEOSE Action Items from the June 2010 Meeting

CEOSE members reviewed the action items that were compiled out of the minutes of its June 2010 meeting. **ACTION ITEM:** *The nomination process for new members of CEOSE is to be opened prior to the February CEOSE meeting. Nominations are to be sent to Dr. Tolbert for appropriate action. Also, she is to make nomination announcements to NSF officials and stakeholders.*

CEOSE General Discussion

Members and guests discussed a number of topics pertinent to the CEOSE mandate.

1) The Letter to the NSF Director on Broader Impacts and Broadening Participation was discussed. **ACTION ITEM:** *Dr. Tolbert is to provide CEOSE members with a copy of the June*

DRAFT

2008 letter about the Broader Impacts Criterion. This is the letter that was sent to **Dr. Arden L. Bement, Jr.** who was then the NSF Director. **ACTION ITEM: Dr. Poston** will prepare a cover letter and submit it, along with the June 2008 letter about the Broader Impacts Criterion, to **Dr. Marrett** for submission to the NSB.

2) An Overview was given by **Dr. Hollis** of the White House Initiative on Historically Black Colleges and Universities on the proposed CBP-US Program. On behalf of his organization, he expressed significant concern about proposed plans to merge programs that are focused on Historically Black Colleges and Universities into the proposed CBP-US Program.

3) **Attorney Baskerville**, president of the National Association for Equal Opportunities in Higher Education (NAFEO), commented on her organization (one hundred five Historically Black Colleges and Universities and 75 Predominantly Black Institutions form the NAFEO membership base) and the letter that was sent to NSF about the CBP-US Program. In that letter, she wrote: “We believe that aspects of the proposed CBP-US Program would unwittingly retard and reverse the progress that is steadily being made in increasing the numbers of African Americans and other traditionally underrepresented students in STEM. A copy of the full text of the July 28, 2010 letter is available on the NAFEO website.

4) **Dr. Collier** gave an update on the Preparation of the 2009-2010 CEOSE Biennial Report to Congress. **ACTION ITEM: CEOSE members** agreed to prepare a white paper or an addendum to the “2009-2010 CEOSE Biennial Report to Congress” to capture evaluation results of the NSF broadening participation programs. This depends on the availability of the data and funds to conduct this work. **ACTION ITEM: CEOSE members** are to review and provide comments on the draft of the “2009-2010 CEOSE Biennial Report to Congress” when this document is made available to them. **ACTION ITEM: Dr. Tolbert** is to collect from NSF directorates and major offices demographic data on advisory committees and committees of visitors for use in the “2009-2010 CEOSE Biennial Report to Congress”.

ACTION ITEM: At the February 2011 meeting, CEOSE members are to review NSF responses to its recommendations. The review will begin with recommendations submitted most recently and will include those from the mini-symposia as early as the one on Institutions that Serve Persons with Disabilities. The effort is to identify systemic changes within NSF.

Progress Report on Correcting the Multi-Race Coding Error in the Survey of Doctorate Recipients by Dr. Lynda T. Carlson, Director of the Division of Science Resources Statistics (SRS)/SBE/NSF

Dr. Carlson and **Dr. Cohen** gave the indicated progress report and responded to questions from CEOSE members. **ACTION ITEM: Dr. Carlson** will appoint an SRS staff member to provide the CEOSE Chair with the correct data and text for Tables 1.7 and 1.8 of the “2007-2008 CEOSE Biennial Report to Congress.”

An Update on Plans to Establish the Science of Broadening Participation Program by Dr. Kellina Craig-Henderson, Program Director, Behavioral and Cognitive Sciences Division, SBE/NSF

Dr. Craig-Henderson gave a presentation on the above topic and responded to questions and comments from CEOSE members. CEOSE members did not develop any action items pertinent to this report.

Expanding Underrepresented Minority Participation: America’s Science and Technology Talent at the Crossroads by Dr. Peter H. Henderson, Co-Study Director and Director of Board on Higher Education and Workforce, Policy and Global Affairs Division of the National Research Council and Dr. Earnestine Psalmonds, Co-Study Director and Program Director in the Division of Graduate Education, EHR/NSF

Dr. Henderson spoke of the importance of having this discussion on the National Academies report, *Expanding Underrepresented Minority Participation: America’s Science and Technology Talent at the Crossroads*, and the utility and timeliness of the information. Suggestions of follow up responses to the report are very important. **Dr. Henderson** acknowledged the present and former CEOSE members (**Dr. Harris**—former CEOSE Chair, **Dr. Hammonds**, and **Ms. Begay-Campbell**) who served as members of

DRAFT

the study committee that was chaired by **Dr. Freeman Hrabowski**, president of the University of Maryland Baltimore County, and the study sponsors—NSF, NIH, NASA, NAS, the Haas Foundation, and the Carnegie Corporation of New York. **Dr. Henderson** noted that the committee membership was diverse in terms of gender, race/ethnicity, and institution types. He and **Dr. Psalmonds** responded to questions and comments from CEOSE members and special guests. CEOSE members did not develop any action items pertinent to this report.

Plans for the Conversation with Dr. Cora B. Marrett, Acting Deputy Director, National Science Foundation

CEOSE members discussed questions to be asked of **Dr. Marrett** during her meeting with them on October 26th.

ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned at 5:15 p.m.

Tuesday, October 26, 2010

Opening Statement and Discussion (Meeting Opening Time: 8:30 A.M.):

In her opening statement, **Dr. Poston** reviewed the plan for the meeting and advised of a change in the agenda. **ACTION ITEM: Dr. Ladner** agreed to represent CEOSE at the December 2010 meeting of the NSB. He is to focus on the work of the NSB Task Force on Merit Review and provide insights on CEOSE's view of the broadening participation component of the Broader Impacts Criterion.

Demographics of the National Science Board by Dr. Marigold Linton, CEOSE Member

Dr. Linton reported on the NSB and responded to questions and comments from CEOSE members and guests. **ACTION ITEM: CEOSE members** are to develop and implement a plan to nominate well qualified individuals for membership on the NSB.

Report on The White House Summit on Community Colleges by Dr. Eugenia Paulus, CEOSE Member

Dr. Paulus acknowledged the presence at the White House Summit on Community Colleges of **Ms. Baskerville** of NAFEO and **Dr. Hollis** of the White House Initiative on Historically Black Colleges and Universities. Both of these persons were special guests at this CEOSE meeting. **Dr. Paulus** then provided full details on The White House Summit on Community Colleges and her impressions of this most valuable and informative event.

General Discussion

CEOSE members discussed the draft plan that **Dr. Ladner** developed as a framework for NSF Assistant Directors to use as a guide when they make presentations at CEOSE meetings. **ACTION ITEM: The draft framework for NSF Assistant Directors and Major Office Directors to use when making CEOSE presentations will be revised by Dr. Ladner based on the discussion of October 26, 2009, finalized, and acted upon by CEOSE members at their February 2011 meeting.**

A Conversation with Dr. Cora B. Marrett, Acting Deputy Director, National Science Foundation

Dr. Marrett held an interesting conversation with CEOSE members, federal liaisons, and special guests. Her primary objective while meeting with CEOSE members was to hear what they would like to have as high priorities for the new director and to have a strong indication of what he can expect from a very supportive group of people and the institutions they represent. After making a brief statement on NSF, she was joined by **Dr. Ferrini-Mundy** in responding to questions and comments. **Dr. Ferrini-Mundy's**

DRAFT

comments were focused on the proposed CBP-US Program. **ACTION ITEM:** *CEOSE members were requested to frame several issues that would enable progress as NSF moves forward in broadening participation. They are to continue providing input from the respective CEOSE communities on the proposed CBP-US program.*

CEOSE General Discussion

- **Dr. Martinez** announced that he will retire on December 31st; therefore, this meeting is his last one as the US Department of Energy Liaison to CEOSE.
- **Dr. Espinosa**, Director of Policy and Strategic Initiatives at the Institute for Higher Education Policy, has been working with **Dr. Ong** for years. They are in the same research field. **Dr. Espinosa** described an NSF-sponsored program in which she is involved. The plan is to assist NSF in its broadening participation approach through data analyses/trends analyses over the last 20 years. The program, which is led by **Dr. Carlos Rodriguez** of the American Institute of Research is designed to review information on institutions across the country, higher education institutions that are producing a large number of minority students in STEM.
- **Finalizing Recommendations Based on Suggestions from the Mini-Symposium on Women of Color in STEM:** **Dr. Ong** reviewed the most recent version of CEOSE recommendations that emerged from the Mini-Symposium on Women of Color in Science, Technology, Engineering, and Mathematics: Perspectives on Experiences, Research, Evaluation, and Policy in Higher Education and Careers, which was held on October 27-28, 2009. CEOSE members provided comments on the draft recommendations, which were developed by CEOSE members based on suggestions from the mini-symposium. **ACTION ITEM:** *Dr. Ong agreed to revise the list of recommendations that were discussed at the October 2010 meeting of CEOSE in accordance with comments received. The final version is to be sent to Drs. Poston and Tolbert for appropriate action.*
- In a discussion of future topics to be addressed at CEOSE meetings, the following were identified: community colleges, Minority Serving Institutions (e.g., Historically Black Colleges and Universities, Tribal Colleges and Universities, and Hispanic Serving Institutions), and agriculture. Also, it was noted that Federal Liaisons and guests are welcome to participate in the discussions held at meetings; however, they do not have voting authority. Although CEOSE meetings are open to the public, several special guests are always invited to attend. **ACTION ITEM:** *Dr. Tolbert is to include a list of the special invited guests in the CEOSE meeting binders. A separate list of Federal Liaisons to CEOSE is to be included too.*

RECOMMENDATION: *Dr. Tolbert is to contact the appropriate OSTP official to set up the structure for CEOSE to meet with representatives of several federal agencies on the topic of broadening participation in STEM.*

ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned at 1:50 p.m.

CERTIFICATION OF THE ACCURACY OF THE CEOSE MEETING MINUTES

On January 7, 2011, **Dr. Muriel Poston**, Chair of the Committee on Equal Opportunities in Science and Engineering, approved the minutes of the October 25-26, 2010 meeting via telephone message to **Dr. Margaret E.M. Tolbert**, CEOSE Executive Liaison.