



NATIONAL SCIENCE FOUNDATION
OFFICE OF INSPECTOR GENERAL
OFFICE OF INVESTIGATIONS

CLOSEOUT MEMORANDUM

Case Number: A-03020010

Page 1 of 1

We received allegations the subject¹ used ideas developed by his graduate student (the student) inappropriately in an NSF funded proposal,² in the NSF Final Report for the funded proposal, and in a presentation at a major research institution.³ We reviewed numerous documents provided to our office in support of the allegations. We also received a copy of the subject's University's final inquiry report into similar allegations, which concluded that no grounds existed to warrant a formal investigation.

Our inquiry determined that the graduate student worked together with the subject in writing the NSF funded proposal. The subject included the student's curriculum vitae in the proposal, listing him as a participant and budgeting him for support, which he received. We learned from the student that he and the subject had worked together for more than a year prior to the preparation and submission of the NSF proposal, work that resulted in co-authored publications.⁴ Some of the ideas present in the publications were, according to the student, incorporated into the NSF proposal. We concluded that there was no substance to the allegation that the subject inappropriately used any of the student's ideas in the funded proposal.

Our inquiry concluded that, because the student was listed as a co-author on the NSF Final Report for the funded proposal, there was no substance to the allegation that any of the student's ideas had been used inappropriately in this report.

Finally, the student provided us with copies of the subject's slides used for the presentation at the research institution. We noted that the subject cited the student by name on one slide and cited their co-authored publications on three other slides. We concluded that there was no substance to the allegation that the subject had used the student's ideas inappropriately in the presentation.

This case is closed and no further action will be taken.

¹ The subject, [REDACTED], is a faculty member in [REDACTED].

² NSF proposal [REDACTED], entitled "[REDACTED]" submitted by the subject as the sole PI.

³ [REDACTED]

⁴ [REDACTED]