



NATIONAL SCIENCE FOUNDATION
OFFICE OF INSPECTOR GENERAL
OFFICE OF INVESTIGATIONS

CLOSEOUT MEMORANDUM

Case Number: A-04020007

Page 1 of 1

We received an allegation that the subject's¹ NSF proposal² contained an idea taken from another scientist's unpublished manuscript³ without appropriate attribution (intellectual theft).

During our review of this matter, we learned that the scientist provided a copy of the manuscript to the subject's research group, a group with which he informally collaborated over the years because of their common research goals. We reviewed a copy of the manuscript, the NSF proposal, the published papers by the subject, the scientist, and the research group, and compared the specific idea presented in the manuscript with the alleged same idea in the proposal. We determined that the idea in the scientist's manuscript, although similar to the idea presented in the subject's NSF proposal, was part of the larger research effort that included the long-term development of hypotheses by the research group and the scientist. As such, the idea that was allegedly stolen from the manuscript was not clearly separable from the overall development of the hypotheses presented by the group, the subject, and the scientist. There was insufficient substance to pursue this allegation.

This case is closed and no further action will be taken.

¹ [REDACTED] (the subject) is a [REDACTED]

² NSF proposal [REDACTED], entitled "[REDACTED]" was submitted by the subject.

³ The manuscript, by [REDACTED], was entitled "[REDACTED]"