

## CLOSEOUT FOR M-94060022

On June 22, 1994, [REDACTED] Program Director [REDACTED]

brought an allegation of misconduct in science to OIG's attention. The complainant,

[REDACTED] is a faculty member in the [REDACTED]

[REDACTED] In his role as an ad hoc reviewer, the complainant alleged that the subject,

[REDACTED] misrepresented information in an NSF proposal, [REDACTED]

[REDACTED] submitted by the subject with one co-PI.

Specifically, the complainant alleged that five papers listed in the subject's "Publications Resulting from Award" section as representing work done under a previous NSF [REDACTED] award, [REDACTED] (the award) were misleading. The complainant alleged that, on the basis of the submission or acceptance dates provided by the subject in his proposal for the five papers, all the work contained in them could not have been supported by the award. Three of the papers were submitted shortly after the award's initiation, while two of the papers were accepted for publication just prior to the award's initiation. The co-PI on the proposal was not considered a subject in this case because he was not associated with any of the information provided in the subject's statement.

OIG reviewed the subject's NSF proposal and the award as well as the five papers identified by the complainant. OIG found that three of the five papers were submitted between four and five months after the official initiation of the award while the other two papers were submitted three and eleven months prior to its official initiation. All five papers were published after the award's initiation.

OIG noted that the acknowledgment sections in all five papers indicated that the subject's NSF award supported the work. In addition, four of the five papers acknowledged that an NSF Graduate Student Fellowship (GSF) supported the work.

With regard to the three papers submitted from four to five months after the award's initiation, OIG noted that all three papers were published well over a year later. OIG concluded that the additional work associated with final analyses, revisions, and publication costs was well within the time frame in which the subject was supported by the award. Therefore it was appropriate for the subject to acknowledge NSF support and to list these papers as part of the work done under the award.

## **CLOSEOUT FOR M-94060022**

OIG wrote to the subject requesting information about the acknowledgment 1) to the GSF support that we were unable to identify, and 2) to the award's support for the work associated with the two papers that had been submitted prior to the award's official initiation. The subject's response provided explanations with appropriate supporting documentation.

The subject provided documentation that his graduate student, who had been a co-author on four of the five papers, had been supported under an NSF GSF for three years beginning one year prior to the official initiation of the subject's award. OIG concluded that the subject had properly acknowledged NSF support for his graduate student in the four papers.

The subject explained and documented that he asked for and received permission from his institution's Grants and Contracts Office to incur pre-award costs beginning about three months prior to the award's official initiation date. He requested this after he learned from a program officer that he would receive the award. He explained that, with respect to the two papers submitted prior to the official initiation of the award, both involved the commitment of award and pre-award costs for the verification of research and required revisions. In addition, for the one paper submitted eleven months prior to the official initiation of the award, pre-award costs were committed for the payment of excess page charges.

OIG concluded that the subject had properly acknowledged his NSF support. There was no substance to the allegation that the subject had misrepresented his NSF support in his proposal.

This inquiry was closed and no further action will be taken in this case.

cc: Staff Scientist, Deputy AIG-Oversight, AIG-Oversight, IG