



NATIONAL SCIENCE FOUNDATION  
OFFICE OF INSPECTOR GENERAL  
OFFICE OF INVESTIGATIONS

**CLOSEOUT MEMORANDUM**

Case Number: M97110044

Page 1 of 1

On 14 November 1997, the complainant<sup>1</sup> informed OIG about an allegation of misconduct in science. He alleged that the subject<sup>2</sup> stole ideas (intellectual theft) from the complainant's unpublished critique. The complainant's critique discussed two papers in Journal 1, one of which listed the subject as the primary author (paper 1)<sup>3</sup>. The complainant explained that, after preparing his critique, he followed Journal 1's guidelines: sent a copy of the critique to the primary authors of the two papers for their responses, and subsequently submitted the critique and responses to Journal 1. The critique was rejected by Journal 1. The complainant said that he later discovered a publication in Journal 2 (paper 2)<sup>4</sup> on which the subject was the primary author and was the only author on paper 2 that was also an author on paper 1. The complainant alleged that paper 2 contained ideas taken by the subject from the complainant's unpublished critique without proper citation. OIG reviewed the information provided by the complainant and other relevant publications.

OIG noted that subject's paper 1, published before he received a copy of the complainant's unpublished critique, contained a discussion related to the ideas that the complainant alleged were taken from his critique. Further, the complainant's unpublished critique contained six citations supporting his idea, two of which were authored by the subject. OIG concluded that the complainant's ideas, which he alleged were stolen from his critique, were not sufficiently unique to him to support the allegation. There is no substance to the allegation that the subject stole the complainant's ideas.

This case is closed and no further action will be taken.

<sup>1</sup> [redacted] is a faculty member in the [redacted]

<sup>2</sup> [redacted] is a faculty member in the [redacted]

<sup>3</sup> Paper 1, authored by [redacted]

<sup>4</sup> "[redacted]" by [redacted]

	Agent	Attorney	Supervisor	AIGI
Sign / date				